Guide Document 19
Preparing for the Team Visit: Equity and Inclusion

Goals

This document provides an overview of how to address questions of equity and inclusion by the Middle States Team Visit, and what could potentially be next steps in advancing the College's work on equity and inclusion.

This document was built using the findings of the Self-Study, and through consultation with various Working Group members, Steering Committee members, faculty, and staff, including the new Executive Director of DEI, Wendy Nicholson.

Context: Middle States Recommendations

SII: LaGuardia should create a Social Equity Plan that establishes a diverse, equitable, and inclusive community in response to student, faculty, and staff feedback, and that addresses Universal Design and/or strategies of accessible design.

SVI: The College should develop procedural guidelines and periodic assessment for the College-Wide and departmental Personnel and Budget committees, in addition to training and guidelines to address actual or perceived conflict of interest.

SVII: The College should develop periodic assessments of the College Senate and Faculty Council, and further clarify the relational structure of the College's overall governance.

Part 1: Background & Resources

LaGuardia's Strategic Plan Priority (SPP) #4 is "Build Inclusive Community to Achieve the College Mission." The AES executive summaries and the Key Performance Indicators of the Strategic Plans and institutional effectiveness provide evidence for how it. See Appendix A for a list of the AES units currently measuring SSP #4.

Important faculty and staff surveys can be found on the Institutional Effectiveness website under **Evaluation studies**. Students' survey and analysis include: The Pandemic Impact on Support Services and Student Needs and Distance Learning Experience and the Pandemic Impact on Education. Also see The Impact of the Covid 19 Pandemic.

KPIs from the Strategic Plan: See Appendix B below or check KPIs of the Strategic Plans.

Part 2: Framing DEI within existing initiatives: students, faculty, & staff

The College hired its first Executive Director of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, Wendy Nicholson, in Summer 2021. The Director's duties include developing and implementing programs in collaboration with departments to support recruitment, retention, and promotion of diverse faculty and staff. She is currently creating a Social Equity Plan.

How are we addressing equity and inclusion when it comes to <u>students</u>?

- **The Tomorrow Campaign.** President Adams launched a fund-raising campaign, and we are close to raising $15 million toward helping students with scholarships and meeting various needs (such as food insecurity).

- **ACE Scholarships**. LaGuardia expanded scholarship aids to Adult and Continuing Ed (ACE) students and subsidized several programs to ensure a skilled workforce.

- **ACE Credit for Prior Learning (CPL).** LaGuardia was recently awarded a grant from the Robinhood Foundation to award students CPL. For more details, read LaGuardia Credit For Prior Learning Project.

- According to KPIs (see Appendix B below), **we are examining retention gaps for underrepresented minority students** to improve services and retention rates.

- **AES assessment.** See AES unit assessments listed in Appendix A.

- **Advising**. Although our advising models are adapting, initiatives including First Year Seminar can be tools for advancing equity. (Ellen Quish and Andrea Francis wrote a case study for the Advising Success Network on this: [advisingsuccessnetwork.org]; their case starts on page 21).

- **Class size.** From the start of the pandemic, LaGuardia committed to funding a substantial number of classes despite low enrollment. Some courses ran with single digit enrollment in order to increase access to a wider range of class schedule. In 2020-2021, there were 388 sections with enrollment of 10 students or less.

- **Peer Programs**. LaGuardia has a plethora of peer programs aimed at providing students with a pre-professional work experience. Mentors in peer programs guide students at different point in their journey including in their semester (e.g., the Student Success Mentor of the First-Year Seminar). Mentors share their experiences with students in various contexts to inspire persistence and success. CREAR Futuros and BMEC are part of the multicultural exchange.

- **Pre-College Programs in ACE**. These programs open pathways to Higher Education for underserved communities in Queens and larger NYC area: GED Testing Center, CUNY Fatherhood Academy, CUNY Start/CUNY Math, CUNY Language Immersion Program (CLIP).

- **Student Learning Outcomes.** LaGuardia continued to measure outcome assessment in some courses, which have shown results that are in line with historical indicators despite the change in course modality.

- **Core Competencies.** The College's focus on **Global Learning** as a signature core competency centers diverse curriculums and inclusive pedagogies. **Integrative learning** also has value for inclusion by offering students an opportunity to recognize/reflect on who they are, and what they bring to their college experience.

- **DEI and Trauma informed pedagogy**: Over the past two years, **Showing Up for Racial Justice (SURJ)** has fostered classroom strategies to recognize the experiences and struggles of students and colleagues of color via regular open workshops for faculty. These

strategies shared an established pedagogical model for responding to trauma appropriate to our students as we develop awareness of emotional needs in teaching and learning.

- **Co-Curricular Opportunities.** Initiatives include the [President's Society Environment Program](#) and Apprenticeship Opportunities. In collaboration with faculty in Computer Science, the Mastercard Apprenticeship opportunity launched in the Fall for students to gain experience in cybersecurity. There are research programs that are specific for under-represented minority students, including:

    i) Bridges to the Baccalaureate Programs, and CUNY Research Scholars Program (CRSP);
    ii) Elsevier Women in STEM grant;
    iii) United States Department of Agriculture – Hispanic Serving Institution grant project SEMBRAR (Growing and Diversifying the next generation of Agricultural STEM leaders).

- **Co-Curricular Events: Black History Month, Black Lives Matter Summit, Hispanic Heritage Month etc.** These events give students a sense of belonging. In Fall 2021, the College launched a Unity Week organized by the [DEI](#) Executive Director in collaboration with various campus groups.

- **Open education resources** (OER). Different departments work with the library supporting this effort to reduce textbook costs.

- **New majors.** In Fall 2022, we are adding a liberal arts Ethnic Studies option; recently, we added a Women and Gender Studies major.

- **CUNY's [Performance Management Plan](#) (PMP)** displays equity gaps in retention, the race/ethnic composition of students and faculty. The recent CUNY Chancellor's PMP guidance letters requested that the college presidents present information about Equity gaps (2021) and diversity of first-time students (2020)

How are we addressing Equity and Inclusion when it comes to <u>faculty</u>?

- LaGuardia is committed to **improving faculty's experiences.** Results from two recent iterations of the Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education (COACHE) survey from 2015 and 2019 demonstrated differences between women and faculty of color and their white male colleagues; women and faculty of color feel that they and/or their ideas are discounted because of race, ethnicity, and/or gender. These results have served as evidence to identify and implement changes. Working with the Committee of Faculty in the Senate and Faculty Council (FC), a channel of communication was opened with the Provost to identify institutional actions to change practices, procedures, and policies of tenure-track faculty evaluation and reappointment.

- In response to the results of the COACHE Survey, in 2016 the **Faculty and Staff of Color (FSOC) Collective** was formed in part to explore the issues that contributed to underrepresented minorities (Black, Hispanic, and Native American) not experiencing the campus as favorably as White and Asian colleagues. Since its inception, the FSOC Collective has conducted tri-semesterly meetings and workshops to engage faculty and staff of color and the broader campus community to identify opportunities for improvement in the environment for people of color. During Fall 2018, the FSOC Collective met with

Provost Dr. Paul Arcario to express their desire to conduct a campus-wide climate survey of all faculty and staff of color The results of the climate survey are part of the evidence used in the Self-Study (see the climate survey report).

- **DEI and trauma informed pedagogy.** Over the past two years, **Showing Up for Racial Justice (SURJ)** has led discussions with approximately 50 faculty to learn more about experiences and struggles of students and colleagues of color, and to explore ways of promoting diversity, equity, and inclusion on and off campus.

  Trauma-informed pedagogy is a regular discussion in some faculty and staff circles (see Opening Sessions 2021). Two professors provided workshops during opening sessions and during the Fall 2021 semester about how respond to trauma on and off campus. Their workshop shared an established model for responding to trauma and began a process of collectively developing a pedagogy appropriate to our students as we develop awareness of emotional needs in teaching and learning.

- **The Anti-Racist Caucus (ARC).** In 2020, SURJ joined with the **Faculty and Staff of Color Collective (FSOC)** affinity group to create the **Anti-Racist Caucus (ARC)**, which serves as a vehicle for collective action in creating a more inclusive and equitable campus and community. These initiatives aim to increase the sense of belonging among our students and to facilitate difficult conversations that are sustainable across all modalities of instruction.

- **Retention & promotion criteria for Full Professor.** The majority of faculty earn reappointment and promotion based on the following criteria: teaching, departmental service, college-wide contributions, student guidance, and scholarly work. To earn promotion to full professor, faculty have demonstrated leadership at the college-level; however, resulting from the COACHE survey results, the College-Wide Personnel and Budget committee amended the criteria to accept leadership in any of the reappointment/promotion categories.

- **Fellowship Leave.** To ensure that the pandemic did not disrupt faculty plans for conducting scholarship, faculty with approved fellowship leaves were given the option to postpone their leave.

- **Extending non-reappointment and pausing the tenure clock.** As a college standing in the eye of the pandemic, a one-year extension became possible for faculty whose college contribution work was interrupted, leading to non-reappointment in the academic year 2019-2020. Additionally, the CUNY PSC union negotiated the possibility of a pause on the tenure clock for junior faculty following discussion with their chairpersons.

- **Examine and review faculty financial expenses for tenure and promotion**. The road to tenure and promotion can be financially taxing for faculty, including for BIPOC faculty members, for those without family or other supports to pay for expensive conferences. This is especially urgent as the College and CUNY appear to be withdrawing and/or reducing funding for scholarly activities. While during the pandemic many conferences have gone online, it seems that many are returning in-person expectations, with accompanying fees and expectations.

- A goal of the CTL is to **coordinate and support faculty and staff professional development** that addresses the diverse needs of our new majority students and faculty.

This goal supports "Build Inclusive Community to Achieve the College Mission." Outcomes include:

- Measuring completion rates in courses taught by CTL seminar participants compared with courses taught by non-CTL participants.
- Overview of findings or outcomes +7.0 higher completion for students in target courses.
- Relevant Professional development opportunities include: Language Across the Curriculum, and Access & Ableism.

- **Senate subcommittees**: The **Ad-hoc Online Learning Committee's** will revise the online learning policies for the College. T**he Ad-hoc IT Advisory Committee** has membership representing all academic departments and all divisions of the College to facilitate communication and coordination to meet the College's I.T. needs. These committees contribute to inclusion by making technology and online learning more accessible, and by representing faculty and staff from across the college.

- **Student evaluation reform.** The College developed a new survey instrument for student evaluations of faculty to replace the existing Student Instructional Reports (SIRs), with implementation planned for Spring 2022. The new instrument aims to reduce bias based on race and gender. Additionally, from Spring 2020-Spring 2021 faculty did not have to include the results of the student evaluations in their annual evaluations but could administer the former instrument to get feedback.

- **Inclusion of governance on President's Cabinet**. The Chairperson of the College Senate and the President of Faculty Council (FC) were included President's Cabinet starting in 2019-20. Recommendation from Standard VII will hopefully strengthen the governance role of Faculty Council.

- **Meetings with Labor Management.** The President maintains an open-door policy to discuss labor-management issues, and has increased the frequency of regularly scheduled meetings with the union chapter. In November 2021, President Adams was a guest at the adjunct/part-time chapter meeting. As the campus was reopening, the union chapter was concerned about health and safety issues. Together, they discussed health and safety protocols to plan a safe return to campus. In response, Vice President of Administration Shahir Erfan organized walking tours and brought external engineering firms from CUNY to help assess the situation. The College has been responsive to complaints related to safe reopening of classrooms, and the union chapter played a central role in communicating and addressing the concerns in collaboration with the College leadership.

How are we addressing Equity and Inclusion when it comes to staff?

- **Staff surveys.** To include staff voices in future directions of the College, the College Senate Committee of Staff and Alumni championed an Employment Engagement Survey. Its results have been shared and discussed with College leadership and governance.

- **AES missions.** See AES units assessment listed in Appendix A (Please refer to the AES executive summaries for full details.)

  Example: **OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE AND DIVERSITY/OFFICE OF THE TITLE IX COORDINATOR** (the points below apply to faculty and staff).

  - **Goal 1:** Recruit, employ, retain and promote a diverse faculty and staff.

- Recruit a diverse applicant pool by measure of # of female/minority applicants that apply to the College's job postings compared to Department of Labor data indicating the statistical availability of female/minority applicants.

- Strategy**:** Issue clear guidelines on tenure and promotion, develop female/minority tenure and promotion workshops, and propose diversity advocates in tenure in College-wide P&B deliberations.

- Strategy**:** Ensure that the search committee evaluating candidates during the resume review and first round interviews is diverse in ethnicity and gender, with specific emphasis placed on ensuring that underutilized ethnicity/gender for a specific job group/LaGuardia CC division/department are represented in the committee.

- Review applicant pool self-identification data to ensure that there is adequate representation of female and minority candidates.

- Advertise in culturally diverse publications, with attempts to target specific female/minority groups where there is underutilization in a specific job group/LaGuardia CC division/department.

- Outcome: Increase the proportion of diverse faculty and staff that are retained.

- **Staff Engagement Survey.** Next steps should include strategies for improvement**.**
  - Evaluate Mission and existing Strategic Plan to strengthen staff inclusion and development.
  - Evaluate compensation plans.
  - Develop strategies to ensure staff participation in all collegewide initiatives.
  - Collaborate with existing on-campus groups and committees to develop recommendations and provide input on action plans.
  - Hold a series of information sessions and discussion groups for staff to improve engagement.
  - Create a college-wide task force which includes HR (RF & LaGuardia), and Institutional Research, that is charged with monitoring, achieving, and reporting improvements. (For the full results check Institutional Effectiveness website under evaluation studies).

- **Inclusion of Senate Chair in President's Cabinet**. The Chair of the Senate represents faculty and staff.

Part 3: Future DEI Initiatives

This question is multi-faceted and requires cross-campus brainstorming and collaboration. The new Executive Director of DEI will solidify a Social Equity Plan. Below are some initial, potential steps to consider as well.

What can we do to strengthen Equity and Inclusion for <u>students</u> going forward? How can a Social Equity Plan enhance and improve the student experience at LaGuardia?

- **Disaggregation of assessment data**. In collaboration with the Office Institutional Research and Assessment (OIRA) and the Center of Teaching & Learning (CTL), we can conduct research to identify equity gaps in pass rates for introductory courses and key gateway courses.

  Disaggregation of assessment data will enable faculty to design strategies to address these gaps. In parallel, we could implement faculty-led professional development focused on equity to focus on evidence and develop appropriate actions.

- **Improve communication** about the availability of financial resources (such as LaGuardia Cares) and academic resources: employ a focused approach to streamline approaches, study usage, identity undervalued resources.

- **Include Student Affairs** in these equity gap and student outcomes suggestions. Advising is an opportunity to advance equity, especially if it is accurate, student-focused, sustained, and utilizes available tools appropriately. Advising can be empowering to students and foster student agency.

- **Empower students** with learning differences, language challenges, or other higher needs for support, so they receive targeted treatment.

- Leverage outcomes of on-going programming to **curate future offerings for evening students**, and make sure they have access to the resources that are vital to their success.

- **Streamline assistance** for students in administrative areas of the College. Make sure the entire College can serve student needs with up-to-date training.

What can we do to strengthen Equity and Inclusion for <u>faculty</u> going forward? How can a social equity plan improve the campus climate?

- **Revisit tenure and promotion criteria** to include equity and inclusion as a leadership category.

- **Strengthen the role of governance** (see the recommendations of S VI and VII). This includes assessment of governance bodies for conflict of interest and assessment of governance for equitable representation and inclusion. It also improves the processes for more inclusive representations for resource allocation (PPRs, etc.).

- **Review resources on equity and inclusion** as it applies to campus climate post-Covid, and implement best practices in coordination with governance leaders.

- **Mandate DEI training** for faculty, staff, and governance. A DEI virtual packet with all resources should be provided to faculty and staff to be able to make informed decisions and for there to be common shared resources.

What can we do to strengthen Equity and Inclusion for <u>staff</u> going forward? How can a social equity plan improve campus climate?

- **Strengthen governance** to help bring staff voices forward.
- Determine next steps for the **Staff Engagement Survey**.
- **Make DEI assessment mandatory** for all AES units.
- **Mandate DEI training** for faculty, staff, and those in governance positions. A DEI virtual packet with all resources should be provided to faculty and staff to be able to make informed decisions and for there to be common shared resources.

Appendix A: AES Units Measuring DEI

The following units use SPP #4 to meet a unit strategic goal.

Office Of Compliance and Diversity/Office of The Title IX Coordinator LaGuardia Performing
LaGuardia Performing Arts Center (LPAC)
Students Right and Responsibilities
Student Advising Services
Health Services, Wellness Center and Office for Accessibility
Campus Life
Center for Teaching & Learning
Finance and Business Office
Human Resources
Public Safety
External Affairs
The Office of Administration and Finance
ACE – Business & Entrepreneur Services

Appendix B: Annual Monitoring of the 2019-2024 LaGuardia Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives: 2020-21

Goal 4. Build Inclusive Community to Achieve the College Mission	PMP (Bold)	AY 2018-19 baseline	AY 2019-20 (actuals)	AY 2020-21 (actuals)	4-Year Target

4a. Examine what diversity means in our unique context, and how to best support underrepresented faculty, staff and students	● **1-year retention gap for first-time full-time URM** ● **1-year retention gap for first-time full-time men** ● **Minority full-time faculty** ● % minority full-time staff ● % minority ECP ● % of Hispanic first-time freshmen ● % of Black first-time freshmen ● % of first-time freshmen who are underrepresented minority (Black and Hispanic (URM)) underrepresented minority (URM) ● % of contracts with MWBE and SDVOB	● 14.1% 1-year retention gap for URM compared to non-URB (F17>F18) ● 8.8% 1-year retention gap for men compared to women (F17>F18) ● 44.4% minority of the full-time faculty (F18) ● 75.4% minority of full-time staff (F18) ● 36.4% minority ECP (F18) ● 46.7% Hispanic (F18) ● 23.1% Black (F18) ● 72.1% of first-time freshmen are URM ● 22% MWBE contacts; 0.4% SDVOB contracts	● 8.7% 1-year retention gap for URM compared to non-URB (F18>F19) ● 4.1% 1-year retention gap for men compared to women (F18>F19) ● 43.1% minority of the full-time faculty (F19) ● 75.7% minority of full-time staff (F19) ● 50.0% minority ECP (F19) ● 46.5% Hispanic (F19) ● 24.9% Black (F19) ● 72.1% of first-time freshmen are URM ● 21% MWBE contacts; 34% SDVOB contracts	● 10.5% 1-year retention gap for URM compared to non-URB (F19>F20) ● 7.5% 1-year retention gap for men compared to women (F19>F20) ● 43.9% minority of the full-time faculty (F20) ● 75.4% minority of full-time staff (F20) ● 44.4% minority ECP (F20) ● 57.2% Hispanic (F20) ● 22.7% Black (F20) ● 81.1% of first-time freshmen are UR ● 79% MWBE contacts; 3% SDVOB contracts	● 8% 1-year retention gap-URM (F22>F23) ● 3% 1-year retention gap-gender (F22>F23) ● 50% minority full-time faculty (F22) ● Maintain minority full-time staff at 75% (F22) ● 55% minority full-time ECP (F22) ● 48% Hispanic (F22) ● 25% Black (F22) ● 73% URM freshmen (F22) ● 30% MWBE contacts; 6% SDVOB contracts[4]
4b. Develop strategies that use our diversity - including language diversity - as a resource for learning	● Number of participants in CTL led diversity focused seminars and activities	● 42 faculty in diversity-focused seminars	● 67 faculty in diversity-focused seminars	● 66 faculty in diversity-focused seminars	● 50 faculty in diversity-focused seminars

4c. Develop an intersectional approach (ways in which race, gender, sexuality, ability, language, etc. overlap and intersect) in order to strengthen understanding and connections across all campus groups	● Number of intersectional clubs ● Number of participants (unduplicated) in the Support Circles	● 8 intersectional clubs in Spring 2019 ● Baseline for number of participants in the Support Circles will be established in 2019-20	● 8 intersectional clubs in Fall 2019 (only 1 in Spring 2020, due to COVID-19) ● 93 students participated in the Support Circles in Spring 2020	● 6 intersectional clubs in Fall 2019 ● 210 students participated in the Support Circles in Spring 2021	● Maintain the number of intersectional clubs at 8 ● Increase participation pf Support Circles by 10% each year
4d. Deepen our relationships with community groups, building enrollment, community-based student support, and opportunities for civic engagement	● Total number of community groups engaged	● Baseline will be as of 2019-20	● 59 community groups engaged in 2019-20	● 56 community groups engaged in 2020-21	● 65 community groups engaged (10% increase)

Institutional Effectiveness KPIs

Goal 4. Build Inclusive Community to Achieve the College Mission	Metrics. (PMP Bold)	AY 2018-19 baseline	AY 2019-20 (actuals)	AY 2020-21 (actuals)	4-Year Target
Increase Proportion of Full-Time Minority Faculty and Staff	●% minority full-time faculty ● % minority full-time staff ● % minority full-time EC	●44.4% faculty (F18) ● 75.4% staff (F18) ● 36.4% ECP (F18)	●43.4% faculty (F19) ● 75.7% staff (F19) ● 50.0% ECP (F19)	●43.9% faculty (F20) ● 75.4% staff (F20) ● 44.4% ECP (F20)	●50% faculty (F22) ● Maintain staff at 75% (F22) ● 55% for ECP (F22)
Increase Diversity of First-Time Freshmen	●% of Hispanic first-time freshmen ● % of Black first-time freshmen ● % of first-time freshmen who are underrepresented minority (Black and Hispanic (URM))	●46.7% Hispanic (F18) ● 23.1% Black (F18) ● 72.1% of first-time freshmen are URM	●46.5% Hispanic (F19) ● 24.9% Black (F19) ● 72.1% of first-time freshmen are URM	●57.2% Hispanic (F20) ● 22.7% Black (F20) ● 81.1% of first-time freshmen are URM	●48% Hispanic (F22) ● 25% Black (F22) ● 73% URM freshmen (F22)

Improve Performance of Underrepresented Minority Students	●1-year retention gap for first-time full-time URM compared to non-URM ● 1-year retention gap for first-time full-time men compared to women	●14.1% 1-year retention gap-URM (F17>F18) ● 8.8% 1-year retention gap-men (F17>F18)	●8.7% 1-year retention gap-URM (F18>F19) ● 4.1% 1-year retention gap-men (F18>F19	●10.5% 1-year retention gap-URM (F19>F20) ● 7.5% 1-year retention gap-men (F19>F20)	●8% 1-year retention gap-URM (F22>F13) ● 3% 1-year retention gap-men (F22>F13)