



STANDARD VII: GOVERNANCE, LEADERSHIP, AND ADMINISTRATION

Standard VII: Governance, Leadership, and Administration

The institution is governed and administered in a manner that allows it to realize its stated mission and goals in a way that effectively benefits the institution, its students, and the other constituencies it serves. Even when supported by or affiliated with governmental, corporate, religious, educational system, or other unaccredited organizations, the institution has education as its primary purpose, and it operates as an academic institution with appropriate autonomy.

Overview

Since its <u>2012 Comprehensive Institutional Self-Study</u>, <u>LaGuardia Community College</u> ("LaGuardia" or "College") has demonstrated an unwavering commitment to its <u>Mission</u>, which is "to educate and graduate one of the most diverse student populations in the country to become critical thinkers and socially responsible citizens who help to shape a rapidly evolving society," and to its <u>Core Values</u>, which are Learning, Diversity, Opportunity, Responsibility, and Innovation. [LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34]

LaGuardia is "governed and administered in a manner that allows it to realize its stated mission and goals in a way that effectively benefits the institution, its students, and the other constituencies it serves." [MSCHE Standard VII] The connections that exist between the Criteria for Standard VII and LaGuardia's Strategic Plan Priorities underscores the College's focus on enriching the student experience, to build inclusive community, to achieve the College's Mission, to build student access and success, and to strengthen learning for students - and for faculty, staff and the College, and advance career and workforce development. [LaGuardia Strategic Directions 2019-2024 Report on the Strategic Directions Summit and JAM 41 and LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34]

In this chapter, we discuss LaGuardia in terms of <u>Standard VII: Governance, Leadership, and Administration</u>, including evidence for which aligns with **Requirements of Affiliation 12 and 13.**

Evidence and Analysis

7.1 A clearly articulated and transparent governance structure that outlines roles, responsibilities, and accountability for decision making by each constituency, including governing body, administration, faculty, staff and students;

LaGuardia is a nationally recognized institution for pioneering innovative education programs and initiatives that are changing the public perceptions about two-year colleges. It is one of 25 colleges within the City University of New York ("CUNY" or "University"), and it is governed by the CUNY Board of Trustees. As an academic institution under the governance structure of CUNY, the College operates with appropriate autonomy and adheres to The Board of Trustees Bylaws, as "they are the highest source of policy created within the University and take precedence over all other internal University policy documents, including non-bylaw policies." [1022, The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419] In addition, LaGuardia functions within the framework of regulations of the U.S. Department of Education, the NYS Education Department, and other relevant federal, state, and local laws.

As stated in <u>Policy 2.08 Governance of the University</u> within the CUNY's <u>Manual of General Policy</u>, "[t]he focus of major decision-making within the University is properly at the college level," and "[e]ach college should be free to create its own governance structure to enable it to create a climate in which rationality can be focused upon the issues that its members consider to be of the greatest academic importance." [Article II - CUNY General Policy 298,995]

There is a commitment for inclusive governance at LaGuardia. The Preamble of the Governance Plan for the College Senate defines governance as "participatory and shared." [2009 Governance Plan 18 and LaGuardia College Senate 118] The principle of shared governance is highlighted in the American Association of University Professors' ("AAUP") Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities, which draws attention to the concepts Shared and Participation. [1023]

At LaGuardia, *Participation* happens in different ways. The governance structure is tripartite, with committees and representation that involve faculty, staff, and students. This structure facilitates communication between different divisions and roles at the College. The governance structure, and the roles and responsibilities of each component, are clearly defined through the Governance Plan for the College Senate, the Constitution and By-Laws for Faculty Council, and the Constitution for the Student Government Association ("SGA"). [2009 Governance Plan 18, College Senate 118, FC-Constitution 863, Faculty Council 113, and Student Government Association Constitution 96] Because of the nature of the College Senate, whose constituents include faculty, staff, and students, the Faculty Council serves as a body positioned to address faculty-specific concerns and to directly advocate for faculty; in addition, the Faculty Council President is also a member of the Senate and currently a member of President's Cabinet. [President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College 848] Similarly, the SGA represents students with its own set of committees and activities, while the SGA President also serves as a student senator. Students also serve on some College Senate committees, such as the Curriculum Committee, as a non-voting member. Elections for the College Senate are conducted in accordance with the College's Governance Plan. [College Senate Curriculum Committee Agenda 3-26-20 689 and 2009 Governance Plan 18] Nominations are made and elections are held for Senators in Fall, and are conducted by secret ballot. [Governance Plan 18] The Faculty Council also issues a call for nominations for department representatives in the Fall. Departmental representatives and alternates are elected in the Fall by majority vote, and they serve two-year terms with officers elected by voting members in the Spring. Election of the department representatives are conducted by majority vote. [FC-Constitution 863] SGA representatives ("Governors") are elected in Spring, and they serve one-year terms with eligibility for one additional term. Candidates must be enrolled for a minimum of six credits, be up to date with payments of tuition and fees, be in good academic standing, and be able to maintain a minimum cumulative Grade Point Average of 2.5, among other criteria. [Student Government Association Constitution 96] Elections are conducted by the Student Election Review Committee ("SERC"). All matriculated students are eligible to vote in elections. [Student Government Association Constitution 96]

At LaGuardia, the AAUP concept of *Shared* also strongly informs governance. In Spring 2019 former Interim President of LaGuardia Paul Arcario expanded <u>President's Cabinet</u> (then called Executive Council) to include the Chairs of the College Senate and <u>Faculty Council</u>, which created new channels for dialogue between faculty and College leaders. <u>President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College</u> 848] This practice continued under the leadership of the President Kenneth Adams. Faculty governance leaders also serve on CUNY's <u>Council of Faculty Governance Leaders</u>. [994] Representatives of the <u>University Faculty Senate</u> regularly attend Faculty Council meetings to provide updates. Members of the SGA also participate in the

University Student Senate, CUNY University Faculty Senate 7871 The College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee plays a role in decision-making concerning faculty. LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98] The membership procedures for this body are described in the Governance Plan, though they do not consider themselves an informal governance body. [2009] Governance Plan 18 and Middle States Academic Chairs Survey 868l The Committee is composed of all ten Department Chairpersons and the Vice President of Academic Affairs, and chaired by the President. According to the College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee's website [98], the Executive Director and the Associate Director for Faculty and Staff Relations from Human Resources serve as non-voting members and are responsible for taking minutes. LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98] As stated in Article VIII Organization and Duties of the Faculty of the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws and the Instructional Staff Handbook, this Committee makes recommendations to the President on decisions relating to appointment, reappointment, tenure, promotion, and fellowship leave for instructional staff (with the exception of non-teaching instructional staff in the Higher Education Officer titles). [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419 and LaGuardia Instructional Staff Handbook 102] Although they deal primarily with personnel matters, the Committee also has discussions concerning budgetary issues. [Middle States Academic Chairs Survey 868] The College's Personnel Review Committee ("PRC") was established as required by the CUNY Board of Trustees, reviews all personnel actions of the College Higher Education Officer Series, as well as selected Classified staff actions, and makes recommendations to the College's President on personnel actions, in accordance with the PRC's Policies and Procedures. [Personnel Review Committee Policies and Procedures 401]

LaGuardia's governance structures belies a strong collaborative ethos in the community, where the focus is always on education and support for students. Transparency and effective communication are critical to building and strengthening shared understanding and strong bonds between faculty and staff. The College Senate shares meeting minutes on its website and announcing meetings to the College community. [College Senate 118] The Faculty Council of which all faculty are de facto members, shares meeting announcements and minutes with other faculty. [Faculty Council 113] Representatives from both groups have representatives give updates on their activities at departmental and divisional meetings and/or via email, as appropriate. The SGA communicates through its website, and student members conduct outreach about events in their classes, in club meetings, and by holding informational sessions/exhibits across the College to connect and communicate with students. [Student Government Association Constitution 96]

7.2. a legally constituted governing body that:

 a. serves the public interest, ensures that the institution clearly states and fulfills its mission and goals, has fiduciary responsibility for the institution, and is ultimately accountable for the academic quality, planning, and fiscal well-being of the institution;

LaGuardia and CUNY adhere to regulations of the U.S. Department of Education, the NYS Education Department, and other relevant federal, state, and local laws. The <u>CUNY mission</u> embodied in state education law, Article 125, Section 6201, states that CUNY "should be maintained as an independent system of higher education governed by its own Board of

Trustees," and "be supported as an independent and integrated system of higher education on the assumption that the University will continue to maintain and expand its commitment to academic excellence and to the provision of equal access and opportunity for students, faculty and staff from all ethnic and racial groups and from both sexes." [CUNY Mission 933] Consistent with CUNY's Mission, LaGuardia's Mission is "to educate and graduate one of the most diverse student populations in the country to become critical thinkers and socially responsible citizens who help to shape a rapidly evolving society." [CUNY Mission 933 and LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34] Furthermore, LaGuardia's Core Values "are woven into the culture of the College and quide the decisions, actions and behaviors of the LaGuardia community." [LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34] The CUNY Board of Trustees serves the public interest, ensuring that the institution clearly states and fulfills its mission and goals, has fiduciary responsibility for the institution, and is ultimately accountable for the academic quality, planning, and fiscal well-being of the institution. To build, promote, and practice a culture of trust and transparency, the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws details policies and procedures for the University to engage the public in Public Hearings and Borough Public Hearings to discuss matters relating to CUNY. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419]

b. has sufficient independence and expertise to ensure the integrity of the institution. Members must have primary responsibility to the accredited institution and not allow political, financial, or other influences to interfere with their governing responsibilities;

LaGuardia has and maintains sufficient independence, in fact and in appearance, to establish, maintain, and ensure the integrity of the College. LaGuardia is committed to ensuring that the College's activities are performed with the highest level of integrity and ethics. Policy 5.01

Academic Personnel Practice of CUNY's Manual of General Policy states that the College's President must "be the guarantor of the integrity of all faculty personnel processes." [Article V 272,995] CUNY's Office of the General Counselstates that as a CUNY employee, "[y]ou may not do anything against [']CUNY's best interest,['] Your first loyalty and duty must be to CUNY." [170, CUNY Legal Affairs - Ethics Info 158] As outlined in Criterion 2h, LaGuardia takes appropriate steps to comply with Article VI of CUNY's Manual of General Policy to ensure that all faculty, staff, and students act with and maintain the highest standards of honesty and integrity when dealing with issues that could pose or be perceived as conflicts of interest. [Article VI - CUNY General Policy 274]

c. ensures that neither the governing body nor its individual members interferes in the day-to-day operations of the institution;

As outlined in **Criterion 1**, LaGuardia is an academic institution under the governance structure of CUNY, and it operates with appropriate autonomy and adheres to The Board of Trustees
Bylaws. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419] In addition, the College adheres to regulations of the U.S. Department of Education, the NYS Education Department, and other relevant federal, state, and local laws.

The shared governance structure of LaGuardia, functioning within the CUNY system, has established policies and processes to ensure that neither the governing body nor individual members interfere in the day-to-day operations of the College. Policy 2.08 Governance of the University of CUNY's Manual of General Policy states that "[t]he focus of major decision-making within the University is properly at the college level," and "[s]uch decisions should not be interfered with by the University administration except where a college decision may affect another college or the University as a whole." [Article II - CUNY General Policy 298,995]

Furthermore, <u>Article 129-A</u> of the Education Law declares that a member of the academic community shall not intentionally obstruct others from exercising their rights, nor interfere with the institution's educational processes or facilities. [Article VI - CUNY General Policy 274]

At LaGuardia, the College Senate's Budget and Finance Committee participates in the decisionmaking process for the budget allocations that are made at the College according to the CUNY directives for consultation. [College Senate 118] To ensure the quality of teaching and learning, the departmental and the College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee enforce the criteria agreed upon in the contract between CUNY and the PSC, and also explained in the Faculty/Staff Handbook. [LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98, LaGuardia Instructional Staff Handbook 102] The Senate's Curriculum Committee guarantees the integrity of the academic curriculum, and the Committee of Faculty certifies degrees every semester. [College Senate 118] The Senate's Committee on Professional Development organizes workshops and seminars for faculty and staff. [997] The Center for Teaching and Learning ("CTL") also engages in the professional development of faculty. [317] The College Senate, Faculty Council, and Personnel and Budget Committee agendas and minutes are on LaGuardia's website. [College Senate 118, FC-Constitution 863, and LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98] In 2019, the College Senate embarked on a revision of the governance plan designed to align the 2009 document with the current practice of governance at the College, and to increase representation and participation of civil service, part-time faculty, and College Laboratory Technicians ("CLTs") in the decision making process, and to add a section describing the chairs' role and responsibilities. [2009 Governance Plan 18] Criterion 1 and criterion 4e details the roles and responsibilities, and work of the Faculty Council and the SGA, and on the College Senate. [Faculty Council 113, Student Government Association Constitution 96, College Senate 118]

Criterion 7.2.h details policies relating to conflicts of interest, ethical and financial disclosures requirements established by the <u>New York State Joint Commission on Public Ethics</u> ("JCOPE") for employees at the College, and specifics of a <u>Multiple Position Report for Full-Time Faculty</u>.[
<u>LaGuardia 2020 Student Handbook</u> 125 and <u>Multiple Position Report for Full-Time Faculty</u> 154]

d. oversees at the policy level the quality of teaching and learning, the approval of degree programs and the awarding of degrees, the establishment of personnel policies and procedures, the approval of policies and by-laws, and the assurance of strong fiscal management;

The <u>CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws</u> and <u>Manual of General Policy</u> grant final oversight authority to the CUNY Board of Trustees for policies regarding teaching and learning, degree programs, personnel, fiscal management, and appointment of the President, while also granting authority to the College to establish, as stated in <u>Section 8.6. Faculty/Academic Councils</u> of the <u>Bylaws</u>, "a faculty or academic council, which shall be the primary body responsible for formulating policy on academic matters." [<u>The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees</u> 419,995] LaGuardia's <u>College Senate</u> bears this responsibility. [<u>College Senate</u> 118] In accordance with the College's <u>Governance Plan</u>, the Senate is a tripartite elected body consisting of faculty, staff, and students. [<u>2009 Governance Plan</u> 18] Much of the formulation of policy is conducted by Senate sub-committees. For instance, the Senate's <u>Academic Standing Committee</u> recommends "regulations and policies to the Senate concerning academic standing, matriculation processes, degree requirements and grading systems." [<u>College Senate</u> 118, <u>2009 Governance Plan</u> 18] The Senate's <u>Curriculum Committee</u> is responsible for "the formulation, development, evaluation, and modification of course and program proposals." [<u>College Senate</u>]

2009 Governance Plan 18] Once curriculum is approved by this committee it comes to the Senate for approval, and then is included in the Chancellor's Report for final approval by the CUNY Board of Trustees. As noted in **Criterion 2c**, the Senate's Committee on Professional Development organizes workshops and seminars for faculty and staff at the College. [College Senate 118]

e. plays a basic policy-making role in financial affairs to ensure integrity and strong financial management. This may include a timely review of audited financial statements and/or other documents related to the fiscal viability of the institution;

The CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws and Manual of General Policy granting final oversight authority to the CUNY Board of Trustees for fiscal management, including the Board having standing committees on fiscal affairs, and the Chair of the committee on fiscal affairs serving as a member on the Executive Committee of the Board. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419,995] Moreover, the Bylaws outlines policies and processes to account for activities relating to Revenues, College Purposes Funds, the Auxiliary Enterprise Corporation, etc. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419] Article 1. Powers and Functions of the College Senate of the College's Governance Plan points to the responsibility of the Senate to review information from the Administration on budgetary appropriations and disposition, and all other available information necessary to implement its functions. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419 and 2009 Governance Plan 18] The Constitution for the SGA outlines the responsibilities of the committees of the College Association Budget Committee, and officers of the group to maintain and report on the fiscal health of the SGA. [Student Government Association Constitution 96 and Student Government Association Constitution 96] Moreover, Section 5 of the Constitution and By-Laws for Faculty Council points to the duties and authorities of the Treasurer to oversee the fiscal well-being of the entity. [FC-Constitution 863 and Faculty Council 113

Issues relating to finances and conflict of interest are addressed in Criterion 2h.

f. appoints and regularly evaluates the performance of the Chief Executive Officer:

As discussed in **Criterion 3b**, Policy 2.12 Presidential Searches of the Manual of General Policy outlines the process and procedures to be followed in searching for the President of a <u>CUNY</u> college. [Article II - CUNY General Policy 298] Moreover, as detailed in **Criterion 4c**, <u>CUNY</u> leverages an <u>Executive Compensation Plan</u> ("ECP") to attract, retain, and develop superior talent at the University and its constituent Colleges. [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] As stated in <u>Section VII. Performance Based Salary Increases</u> of the <u>ECP</u>, "The Chancellor establishes University goals that drive a set of targets and performance indicators at each campus. The campus goals and indicators are used to set individual executive goals and targets. At the end of each academic year, the Chancellor meets with each President to evaluate the President's achievement of these goals." [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785]

As detailed in <u>Policy 5.05 Chancellor and Presidents</u>, <u>Review and Assessment</u> of the <u>Manual of General Policy</u>, The Chancellor, as the University's chief executive officer, and the CUNY Board of Trustees, as the University's policy-making body, reviews the performance and effectiveness of the Presidents of the University's constituent Colleges, and "[e]ach President, in consultation with the Chancellor, at the beginning of his or her term of office and at no more than five-year

intervals thereafter, should establish his or her own performance goals and objectives." [Article V - CUNY General Policy 272,995] The CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws "charge each President with [']the affirmative responsibility of conserving and enhancing the educational standards and general academic excellence of the college under his/her jurisdiction. . . ['] and with wide discretionary powers in acting as the ['executive agent of the Chancellor['] at his or her respective campus." [Article V - CUNY General Policy 272] Major areas that should be included in the evaluation are Academic Leadership, Administrative Leadership, the President's Relationship with the College Community, and the President's Role Outside the College. [Article V - CUNY General Policy 272]

Every year, along with his or her campus's Performance Management Process ("PMP") report, each President at CUNY's constituent Colleges submits a letter outlining campus accomplishments and noteworthy events during the previous year, current challenges and strategies for addressing the challenges (as informed by the PMP), and a plan for the College's specific role in the University. The PMP Review Committee will assess these materials, and "[t]he Chancellor will then review all this information with the President in the President's annual evaluation meeting with the Chancellor, and the content of the meeting will be summarized in the annual evaluation letter from the Chancellor to the President." [Article V - CUNY General Policy 272]

g. is informed in all its operations by principles of good practice in board governance;

In order to establish, promote, and leverage a culture of good practice in board governance at CUNY and its constituent Colleges, the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws details policies and procedures for the University to engage the public in Public Hearings and Borough Public Hearings to discuss matters relating to CUNY. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419] As stated in Article 1. Powers and Functions of the College Senate of the College's Governance Plan, the College Senate shall have responsibility to "[f]ormulate policy governing the conduct and behavior of members of the college community consistent with individual rights and democratic principles." LaGuardia 2009 Governance Plan 18 and College Senate 118] Moreover, the College's Governance Plan states that "[i]t is the intent of the College Senate to follow the bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees in conjunction with this Governance Plan regarding personnel procedures and to recognize the Faculty Council as an elected body concerned with faculty affairs and the Student Government Association as an elected body concerned with student affairs." [LaGuardia 2009 Governance Plan 18]

h. establishes and complies with a written conflict of interest policy designed to ensure the impartiality of the governing body by addressing matters such as payment for services, contractual relationships, employment, and family, financial or other interests that could pose or be perceived as conflicts of interest;

CUNY's Policy 6.01 Conflict of Interest states that "[i]t is the policy of the University that all of its activities shall be conducted in accordance with the highest standards of integrity and ethics and in a manner that will not reflect or appear to reflect adversely on the credibility, objectivity, or fairness of the University, its leadership, faculty or staff." [CUNY Article VI Policy 6.01 Conflict of Interest 242]. Individuals covered by this policy must act with integrity and honesty, and shall not have "any interest, financial or otherwise, direct or indirect, or engage in any business or transaction or professional activity, or incur any obligation of any nature, which is in substantial

conflict with the proper discharge of his or her duties and responsibilities at the University, unless such conflict is properly disclosed and managed consistent with this Policy." [Article VI - CUNY General Policy 274]

Through the Public Officers Law, JCOPEhas established a zero tolerance policy regarding gifts greater than nominal value from prohibited or interested sources such as students, publishers, and persons and business entities doing or interested in doing business with CUNY. [CUNY Legal Affairs - Ethics Info 158] Furthermore, employees at LaGuardia, depending on their roles and responsibilities, compensation, and other criteria, may be required to complete ethics training and file an annual Financial Disclosure Statement with JCOPE. The ethics training offered by the Ethics Officer at the College covers JCOPE laws and regulations on financial disclosure, honoraria, outside activities, and gifts, among other important requirements. [NYS JCOPE - Comprehensive Ethics Training Course 90] LaGuardia is required to certify that all filers have been trained.

CUNY's Office of the General Counsel states that as a CUNY employee, "[y]ou may not do anything against [']CUNY's best interest,['] Your first loyalty and duty must be to CUNY." [CUNY Legal Affairs - Ethics Info 158]

As stated in Policy 5.01 Academic Personnel Practice of the Manual of General Policy, the President of a CUNY college must "be the guarantor of the integrity of all faculty personnel processes." [Article V 272] LaGuardia takes appropriate steps to comply with Article VI of CUNY's Manual of General Policy to ensure that all faculty, staff, and students act with and maintain the highest standards of honesty and integrity when dealing with issues relating to conflict of interest. [Article VI - CUNY General Policy 274] The Multiple Position Report for Full-Time Faculty is completed every semester by full-time faculty at the College, and then it is reviewed by departmental chairpersons and the College's Office of Legal Affairs & Labor Relations. [Multiple Position Report for Full-Time Faculty 154,914] This form is completed by full-time faculty to collect information that will be examine to assess faculty's compliance with CUNY and LaGuardia's policies relating to compensated and uncompensated employment, consultative or other work, grant-funded or other activities, within and outside CUNY, in addition to my full-time employment at the College.

LaGuardia's <u>Student Handbook</u> addresses issues relating to conflicts of interest or perceived conflicts of interest that may arise as a result of relationships between faculty or employees and students, and supervisors and employees. <u>[LaGuardia 2020 Student Handbook 125]</u> Furthermore, the <u>Student Advocate/Ombuds Office</u> offers a confidential, neutral resource for students to voice concerns and complaints, and to receive assistance on issues that they may have. [97] "The ombuds officer serves as a mediator who strives to address issues and facilitates communication and resolution in a fair and equitable manner". <u>[LaGuardia 2021]</u>

i. supports the Chief Executive Officer in maintaining the autonomy of the institution;

Section 11.4. The President of the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws outlines the scope of authority and autonomy for the President of a CUNY college, and it states that a President shall "[h]ave the affirmative responsibility of conserving and enhancing the educational standards and general academic excellence of the college under his/her jurisdiction." [1022, The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419] According to Policy 2.08 Governance of the University of CUNY's

Manual of General Policy, "[t]he focus of major decision-making within the University is properly at the college level," and "[e]ach college should be free to create its own governance structure to enable it to create a climate in which rationality can be focused upon the issues that its members consider to be of the greatest academic importance." [Article II - CUNY General Policy 298,995] The President is "the executive agent of the college and the Board of Trustees," and "the person ultimately responsible to the Board of Trustees, is accountable for seeing that the mission of the college fits into the broader mission of the University. [Article V 272] Section 11.4. The President of the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws outlines the scope of authority and autonomy for the President of a CUNY college. [The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419]

7.3. a Chief Executive Officer who:

a. is appointed by, evaluated by, and reports to the governing body and shall not chair the governing body;

In August 2020, Mr. Kenneth Adams became the fourth President of LaGuardia. He brings a wealth of experience from the education and business sectors to his leadership role at the College. [1020] Prior to Mr. Adams becoming President at LaGuardia, the College was led by Dr. Gail O. Mellow, who stepped down in August 2019 after serving almost 20 years. [1019] From August 2019 to August 2020, Dr. Paul Arcario served as the Interim President for LaGuardia, and returned to the positions of Provost and Senior Vice President when President Adams joined the College. [1018]

As discussed in **Criterion 3b**, <u>Policy 2.12 Presidential Searches</u> of the <u>Manual of General Policy</u>, outlines the process and procedures to be followed in searching for the President of a CUNY college. [<u>Article II - CUNY General Policy 298,995</u>] As detailed in **Criterion 3c**, <u>Section 11.4. The President of the CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws</u> outlines the scope of authority and autonomy for the President of a <u>CUNY</u> college. [<u>The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees 419</u>] **Criterion 2f** details practices in place to evaluate the performance of the President of a CUNY college.

b. has appropriate credentials and professional experience consistent with the mission of the organization;

Since its <u>2012 Comprehensive Institutional Self-Study</u>, LaGuardia has continued to be a leader how we educate and empower students, particularly with its commitment to innovative educational programs and initiatives. [<u>LaGuardia 2012 Self-Study</u> 864] Over the last 10 years, the College has had the privilege to be led by three exceptional Leaders.

After serving almost 20 years as the College's President, <u>Dr. Gail O. Mellow</u>, stepped down from her role at LaGuardia in August 2019. [1019] Under Dr. Mellow's leadership, the College became a recognized leader for launching innovative programs and teaching methods that supported students with learning English, and professional development in the workplace. LaGuardia support services, which includes a food pantry, affordable daycare for student-parents, scholarships, etc., continues to provide the resources needed to help low-income students work towards graduation. Furthermore, small businesses and entrepreneurs leveraged the resources and support of the College to strengthen their operations and create jobs. In the words of CUNY Chancellor Félix V. Matos Rodríguez, "Dr. Mellow has also been a trailblazer for community colleges everywhere; she has been an architect, an innovator, a builder, a nurturer

and a visionary. She has developed so many means to harness the power of education to transform lives." [Dr. Gail O. Mellow 1019

From August 2019 to August 2020, Dr. Paul Arcario served as the Interim President for LaGuardia. Prior to serving in this role, he was appointed as Provost and Senior Vice President of Academic Affairs in 2012. [1018] As Provost and Senior Vice President, Dr. Arcario managed the College's Academic Division's \$40 million annual budget, supervised day-to-day management of key academic initiatives, led faculty recruitment and development, oversaw day-to-day management of key academic initiatives, supervised the Student Affairs Division, and led faculty recruitment and development. He is devoted to students' success, and the preparation of faculty to meet the evolving needs of students. He is the leader of the "Provost Learning Space" where faculty engage in innovative approaches to pedagogy and classroom assessment techniques. Since 2015, 131 faculty participated in the workshop. In August 2020, Dr. Arcario returned to the positions of Provost and Senior Vice President when President Kenneth Adams joined the College. [1020]

Mr. Kenneth Adams is the fourth President of LaGuardia. Before starting his career at CUNY, some of the leadership positions held by Mr. Adams includes serving as Acting Commissioner of the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, President and CEO of Empire State Development, and Commissioner of the NYS Department of Economic Development. Prior to joining LaGuardia, President Adams was dean of workforce and economic development at Bronx Community College ("BCC"), where he led the departments of Adult and Continuing Education, Workforce Development, Career Services, Community and Economic Development, and the Center for Sustainable Energy. Mr. Adams obtained more than \$1.7 million in grants and contracts for BCC, and his team increased enrollment in their programs by 45%. Chancellor Rodríguez remarked that "Kenneth Adams has the skills and track record to ensure that LaGuardia's students can be prominent participants in a post-COVID economy." [1020]

Policy 2.12 Presidential Searches of the Manual of General Policy states the process and procedures to be followed in searching for the President of a CUNY college. [Article II - CUNY General Policy 298,995] Moreover, as detailed in **Criterion 4c**, CUNY benefits from an ECP to attract, retain, and develop superior talent at the University and its constituent Colleges. [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785]

c. has the authority and autonomy required to fulfill the responsibilities of the position, including developing and implementing institutional plans, staffing the organization, identifying and allocating resources, and directing the institution toward attaining the goals and objectives set forth in its mission;

As stated on <u>Policy 5.01 Academic Personnel Practice</u> of the <u>Manual of General Policy</u>, the President is "the executive agent of the college and the Board of Trustees," and "the person ultimately responsible to the Board of Trustees, is accountable for seeing that the mission of the college fits into the broader mission of the University." [<u>Article V</u> 272, 995] <u>Section 11.4. The President</u> of the <u>CUNY Board of Trustees Bylaws</u> outlines the scope of authority and autonomy for the President of a CUNY college. [<u>The Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees</u> 419]

d. has the assistance of qualified administrators, sufficient in number, to enable the Chief Executive Officer to discharge his/her duties effectively; and is responsible for establishing procedures for assessing the organization's efficiency and effectiveness; As outlined in **Criterion 4b**, LaGuardia has a qualified team of administrators to directly support the roles and responsibilities of the President, and several members of this team are part of the President's Cabinet. [President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College 848] Criterion 4a presents the organizational chart for the Division for the President's Office, which outlines the connections between members of the administrative team that supports the duties of the President. [President's Office Org Chart 808] As detailed in Criterion 4c, CUNY leverages an ECP to attract, retain, and develop superior talent at the University and its constituent Colleges. [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] LaGuardia is constantly at the forefront of innovative education programs and initiatives. This is a necessary part of the work of the College to draw on its Core Values, realize its Strategic Plan Priorities and Mission, and fulfill its commitment to create a welcoming environment that fosters diversity, equity, and inclusion. [LaGuardia Strategic Directions 2019-2024 Report on the Strategic Directions Summit and JAM 41, LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34] To plan, implement, follow-up, and continuously improve on the various, dynamic, initiatives on institution, division, program, and unit levels at the College, the Office of Institutional Research & Assessment ("OIRA") "provide[s] accurate, reliable and timely information and analysis to enable data-driven decision making and student success". [LaGuardia OIRA 35] One of the many periodic and on-demand deliverables of the OIRA is the College's Institutional Profile, which provides detailed characteristics, enrollment patterns, and performance outcomes of LaGuardia students.

7.4. an administration possessing or demonstrating:

a. an organizational structure that is clearly documented and that clearly defines reporting relationships;

LaGuardia's organizational structure is clearly defined and communicated via the College's organizational charts, which are updated periodically. There are organizational charts that established the structure of connection, and the reporting mechanism, for the College. As posted on the College's website, these documents convey the relationship between units at the administrative level to faculty, staff, and students, and are as follows:

- Division for the President's Office [President's Office Org Chart 808]
- Division of Academic Affairs, which includes the reporting and communication structure for the Provost & Senior Vice President's Office, each academic department, Counseling/Academic Advisement, Early College High School, the Center for Teaching & Learning, and Registrar [Academic Affairs Org Chart 803]
- Division for Student Affairs, which includes the reporting and communication structure for the Vice President's for Student Affairs & Associate Provost, Access & Achievement, Admissions, Conversion Team, International Student Services, Student Financial Services, Student Information Center, Single Stop, Testing, Student Affairs, Accelerated Studies in Associate Programs, Advisement, Center for Career & Professional Development, College Discovery, CUNY Edge, Transfer Services, Student Engagement, Early Childhood Learning Center, Campus Life, Health Services, Health & Wellness, Office for Students with Disabilities, Recreation, Veteran's Services, and Wellness Center [Student Affairs Org Chart 809]
- Division of Adult and Continuing Education [Adult Continuing Ed Org Chart 805]
- Division for Administration, which includes the reporting and communication structure for the Office of the Vice President, Facilities Management & Planning (including Building Operations, and Public Safety), Finance and Business, and Human Resources [Administration Org Chart 804]

- Division of Information Technology [Information Technology Org Chart 806]
- Division of Institutional Advancement [Institutional Advancement Org Chart 807]

Although the organizational charts do not include details of each position's job duties, the roles and responsibilities of students, instructional staff, and adjunct instructional staff are laid out in the appropriate handbooks. [LaGuardia Instructional Staff Handbook 124, and LaGuardia 2020 Student Handbook 125] Communication of the roles and responsibilities of administrative leaders is conveyed through email announcements when these individuals are hired. When staff, who are not part of the administrative leadership (e.g., Vice Presidents, Deans, etc.) at LaGuardia change roles, this information is not frequently conveyed to the College community.

<u>LaGuardia</u> is a dynamic institution that is committed to diversity, equity, and inclusion. The various divisions and departments, and the faculty and staff represented in the above-noted organizational charts, are dedicated, and work together so that "students can write their own futures, immigrants can achieve their dreams, and small businesses learn how to grow and thrive."

b. an appropriate size and with relevant experience to assist the Chief Executive Officer in fulfilling his/her roles and responsibilities;

LaGuardia's President is supported by a well-credentialed and experienced administrative team that includes, amongst others, the Provost and Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs, Vice President for Administration, Interim Vice President for Adult and Continuing Education, Vice President for Information Technology, Vice President for Student Affairs and Associate Provost for Academic Affairs, Vice President for Institutional Advancement, Executive Legal Counsel to the President & Labor Designee/Assoc. Administrator, and the Chief Diversity Officer. The President, several members of this team, the Chairs of the College Senate and Faculty Council, and any additional members appointed by the President, form the President's Cabinet, which "serves in an advisory capacity to the President and assists in the overall administration of LaGuardia as it fulfills its purpose to educate and support LaGuardia students on their path to graduation." [College Senate 118, FC-Constitution 863, Faculty Council 113, and President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College 848] The President's Cabinet meets on a regular basis, and additionally as circumstances require.

c. members with credentials and professional experience consistent with the mission of the organization and their functional roles;

LaGuardia's <u>Department of Human Resources</u> and <u>Office of Compliance and Diversity</u> are committed to implement and leverage policies and practices to recruit, employ, retain, promote, and provide benefits to qualified faculty and staff who will support the College's <u>Mission</u> and <u>Core Values</u>. [107, <u>AES Executive Summary Assessment Report 2019-20</u> 874 and <u>LaGuardia Mission Core Values</u> 34] As detailed in the <u>Criterion 4a</u>, LaGuardia has ample staffing to support the integrative work of the College. Information about policies and procedures for the recruitment, appointment, evaluation, promotion, professional development, etc., of faculty and staff can be found on the <u>Employee Handbook</u> - <u>Instructional Staff</u> and <u>Employee Handbook</u> -

CUNY established an <u>ECP</u> for its executives designed to "enhance recruitment of superior talent and encourage excellence in performance by its most senior officials." [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] Staff who are included in the <u>ECP</u> "serve in positions charged with leading the University and its constituent Colleges, under the policy direction of the Board of Trustees. Acting in accordance with the Bylaws, they shape, guide, interpret, and embody the mission of the institution, performing a public trust that extends beyond the particulars of their assignments." [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] Leadership roles that are part of the <u>ECP</u> include, amongst others, President, Vice President, Dean, Associate Dean, and Assistant Dean. [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] As noted in the <u>Terms and Conditions of Employment for Staff in the Executive Compensation Plan</u>, CUNY has procedures to ensure hiring of qualified candidates for the ECP, including appointments for an acting/interim basis to these positions. [Terms and Conditions of Employment for Staff in the Executive Compensation Plan 791] The Chief Executive Officer for LaGuardia leads a highly qualified faculty and staff to support the <u>Mission</u> and <u>Core Values</u>, and the administrative, legal, financial, etc., functional areas of the College's operation. [LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34]

d. skills, time, assistance, technology, and information systems expertise required to perform their duties;

As detailed in **Criteria 3b** and **4b**, LaGuardia has a qualified team of administrators with the skills to support their functions at the College. **Criteria 1** and **4b** talks about the role of the <u>President's Cabinet</u> to support the <u>Mission</u> and <u>Core Values</u> of the College. [<u>LaGuardia Mission Core Values</u> 34] Administrators have access to technology courses, webinars, training, and professional development opportunities in technology and information systems to support their functions at the College. These resources and support are available for all faculty and staff through CUNY, and LaGuardia's <u>Center for Teaching and Learning</u> ("CTL"), application providers, and other resources. A list of the technology and information systems support opportunities and resources that are available to faculty and staff can be found on the <u>Faculty</u> Resources page of the College's website. [317, 1021]

e. regular engagement with faculty and students in advancing the institution's goals and objectives;

LaGuardia's Mission and Core Values inform work in all aspects of the College, and along with the Strategic Plan and Priorities are prominently displayed and discussed. [LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34 and LaGuardia Strategic Plan Priorities 42] The process for revising the Mission Statement in 2011, and for developing the 2019-2024 Strategic Priorities in line with the Mission, included faculty, staff and students. [Mission Statement Detailed Process 760 and LaGuardia Strategic Directions 2019-2024 Report on the Strategic Directions Summit and JAM 41] Information about LaGuardia's Mission and Strategic Priorities, as well as the role of shared governance in achieving them, are consistently communicated via divisional, departmental, and College-Wide meetings, emails, and on the College's website. In particular, the College holds Opening Sessions at the start of each semester, which involve a meeting for all faculty and staff, including breakout workshops on topics related to a shared theme. [LaGuardia Opening

Sessions 693] Instructional staff and professional staff meetings near the end of each semester provide further opportunities for the President and/or Provost to share information about new initiatives, assessment results, and future plans for the College community. In these settings, work at the College is often framed in relation to the Mission and Strategic Plan and Priorities.

[LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34 and LaGuardia Strategic Plan Priorities 42] The Mission is shared with students as part of their welcome during student orientation (LaGuardia Virtual New Student Orientation 512, LaGuardia Mission Core Values 34] Information about College initiatives deriving from the Strategic Plan and Priorities, such as the Academic Momentum campaign, are communicated to students via their contact with faculty, advisors, and other support staff, as well as via email, their My LaGuardia Student Portal, and trough texts, digital and printed signs on campus, and the website. [LaGuardia Strategic Plan Priorities 42]

The participation of leaders of the <u>College Senate</u> and <u>Faculty Council</u> in meetings of the <u>President's Cabinet</u>, as detailed in <u>Criterion 1</u>, allows for more immediate and consistent communication between governance and division heads. [<u>College Senate 118</u>, <u>Faculty Council 113</u>, and <u>President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College 848</u>] In addition, the Provost attends joint meetings of the Senate's Committee of Faculty and <u>Faculty Council</u> representatives at least once per semester, allowing an opportunity for the administration to provide requested data and information about college initiatives, and for faculty to ask questions and share concerns. The new college President also has begun to attend College Senate meetings, and the Senate regularly invites members of the administration to present on particular topics of concern to the College community. These opportunities for engagement allow faculty and staff in different divisions to communicate and share information.

The College Senate, Faculty Council, and the SGA use their websites to share relevant information for those interested in running for office for these groups. [College Senate 118, Faculty Council 113, and Student Government Association Constitution 96] These websites also include copies of each group's constitutions, by-laws, and other relevant documents. Each website also offers contact information (e.g., email addresses, phone numbers, and in the case of the SGA, a "Message Us" option built into the website). For the College Senate, the main recruitment effort for at-large faculty and staff senators is an email announcing the upcoming election and soliciting potential candidates. For student senators, the Senate has worked on building more recruitment avenues. There is always an email sent out shortly before the election for student senators, and the Senate also includes information on the need for student senators in the New Student Orientation materials, as well as promote these opportunities in classes, and at various events in the E-Building Atrium (i.e., pre-COVID-19 Pandemic), which are usually staffed by student senators (Cristina Bruns, Chair of College Senate). For Faculty Council, meeting agendas and information are sent to all faculty, who are invited to attend and get involved with the group. Faculty Council also sends representatives to the Academic Standing Workshop for new faculty. Email is their primary means of inviting faculty to run for Faculty Council membership (Rochell Isaac, President of Faculty Council). SGA hosts events and programs, which are promoted through the College's events calendar. Pre-COVID-19, SGA would table in lobbies, promote events in their classes, post notifications around campus, hold office hours, and conduct weekly meetings in their conference room. During the COVID-19 Pandemic, SGA weekly meetings are conducted through Zoom and are publicized on the College's event calendar, promoted through Campus Life's social media accounts, and are emailed to the College community. Flyers and RSVP links are sent to special programs such as Accelerated Studies in Associate Program ("ASAP"), Phi Theta Kappa ("PTK"), College Discovery, and the First Year Seminar. [CUNY ASAP 239, LaGuardiaPhiThetaKappa 511, CUNY Seek-College Discovery 133, SGA Email Evidence 10141

f. systematic procedures for evaluating administrative units and for using assessment data to enhance operations; and

Once Strategic Priorities are set, they become part of the strategic planning process across the College. [Strategic Plan Annual Work Plans Template for Departments and Divisions 49, Department Strategic Plan Reports 2019-2020 813, Department Strategic Work Plans 2020-2021 814, Division Strategic Plan Reports 2019-2020 811, Division Strategic Work Plans 2020-2021 812, and LaGuardia Institutional Effectiveness Plan with Appendices 486] Academic departments undergo a Periodic Program Review ("PPR"), and the outcomes of such assessments inform implementation actions as part of a "closing the loop" process. [PPR 2019-2020 Guidelines 48] Each Administrative and Educational Support (AES) unit also has an established assessment process targeted towards the Mission and Goals of each AES Unit in a process laid out by the Assessment Guide of AES Units. [Assessment AES Mission and Goals 680, Assessment Guide of AES Units 1] As described in the AES Assessment Reports, the findings of these assessments are incorporated into the objectives for the next cycle. [AES Executive Summary Assessment Reports 2019-2020 Final 874]

One way in which the administration has used data to improve its effectiveness is through College-Wide surveys. On the faculty side, the Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education (COACHE) Faculty Job Satisfaction Survey was administered across CUNY in 2015 and 2019, and it provided information about faculty trust and understanding of governance. departmental and senior leadership, among other topics. [CUNY Faculty Affairs COACHE 214, CUNY COACHE 2018 Instrumentation Summary 876] LaGuardia has been a leader among CUNY colleges in its use of this data, sharing the results publicly, such as at the Fall 2017 and Fall 2019 Instructional Staff meetings, and working with Faculty Council to develop and lead initiatives responding to the results. [LaGuardia COACHE 2017 Updated Instructional Staff 122, LaGuardia Instructional Staff COACHE Presentation 11.6.19 596, and Faculty Council Report to Provost Arcario for COACHE I Survey 629] As it relates to efforts of Staff at the College (as outlined in Criterion 5), a similar survey was issued in Spring 2020 for the first time, including both full-time and part-time staff, as a result of the Senate's Committee of Staff and Alumni, with the support of the full College Senate, advocating for non-teaching staff's experiences to also be surveyed. The President's Cabinet has an assessment plan of its own on its website, which will include an annual in-person self-assessment reviewing its work on long-term and short term goals, budget priorities, and the maintenance of agendas and minutes. [President's Cabinet LaGuardia Community College 848]

7.5 Periodic assessment of the effectiveness of governance, leadership, and administration.

At LaGuardia, the evaluation of staff in leadership positions is performed in many forms over a year. In addition to attracting, retaining, and developing superior talent at <u>CUNY</u> and its constituent Colleges, an <u>ECP</u> "creates a framework for goal setting and performance evaluation." [<u>CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan</u> 785] As stated in <u>Section VII.</u>

Performance Based Salary Increases of the <u>ECP</u>, "The Chancellor establishes University goals that drive a set of targets and performance indicators at each campus. The campus goals and indicators are used to set individual executive goals and targets. At the end of each academic year, the Chancellor meets with each President to evaluate the President's achievement of these goals. In the same way that the Chancellor meets with each President to assess goal achievement, each President meets with members of his/her executive team and evaluates their

achievement of individual goals." [CUNY Executive Salary and Compensation Plan 785] Criterion 2f outlines additional processes and procedures in place to evaluate the performance of the President of a CUNY college. LaGuardia's President supports the continued professional development of the leadership team at the College through the engagement of consultants, mentorship opportunities, conference travels, and skill development.

The work of the <u>College Senate</u> is evaluated through year-end reports from its Standing Committees that review the projects undertaken by each committee. [College Senate 118] One of these ongoing projects carried out by the Senate's <u>Committee of Faculty</u>, in collaboration with the College's <u>Faculty Council</u>, has been to address concerns identified in the <u>Collaborative on Academic Careers in Higher Education (COACHE) Faculty Job Satisfaction Survey</u>. [College Senate 118, <u>Faculty Council 113 and CUNY COACHE 2018 Instrumentation Summary</u> 876] One key result is that the Senate's Committee of Faculty and the Faculty Council established a joint meeting each semester with the Provost, ensuring regular communication between faculty and the College's administration. After the success of this effort, the Senate's <u>Committee of Staff and Alumni</u>, with the support of the full Senate, initiated the first-ever survey of staff at the College, which was administered in Fall 2020. [College Senate 118]

Conclusion

LaGuardia Community College operates with appropriate autonomy and adheres to The Board of Trustees Bylaws, as "they are the highest source of policy created within the University and take precedence over all other internal University policy documents. Continuous efforts to both maintain and improve effective governance are necessary. Assessment of the governance process and how the college interacts with the process will further collaborative efforts. The administration must maintain a high level of commitment to assuring that the organization functions to meet strategic outcomes.

Strengths

There is a commitment for inclusive governance at LaGuardia. At LaGuardia, Participation happens in different ways. The governance structure is tripartite, with committees and representation that involve faculty, staff, and students. This structure facilitates communication between different divisions and roles at the College. LaGuardia's governance structures creates a strong collaborative ethos in the community, where the focus is always on education and support for students.

Challenges

Transparency and effective communication are critical to building and strengthening shared understanding and strong bonds between faculty and staff. Improving communication regarding governance matters is critical. Equally important is how the college handles communicating about organizational structure and changes in the organizational structure.

Recommendations

LaGuardia should develop a system of formal periodic assessment of governance practices at the College, including the work being done at the <u>College Senate</u> and its committees, the <u>Faculty Council</u>, the <u>College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee</u>, and other ad-hoc committees. [College Senate 118, <u>Faculty Council 113</u>, and <u>LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98</u>] While shared governance at LaGuardia is

functioning and effective, there needs to be a system of formal periodic assessment. The governance bodies should develop and institute an annual process of reporting its goals, and progress towards those goals at the College. As noted in the 2012 Comprehensive Institution Self-Study, "the College governance system as a whole has no formal, periodic assessment process". [LaGuardia 2012 Self-Study 864] (Reference Criterion 5)

- There are organizational charts for each division at the College; however, there is no
 organizational chart showing the reporting structure of the governing bodies. This
 organizational structure should be created in order to strengthen the structure of
 connection, and the reporting mechanism, for the College. [Reference: Criterion 4a]
- LaGuardia should implement practices and procedures to ensure that the organizational charts and Curricula Vitae of senior administrators are up-to-date, especially when personnel and reporting relationships change throughout the College. One possibility to achieve this could be to create a liaison in each division, responsible for updating the organizational charts within that division. [Reference: Criterion 4a]
- Much work is being done by the College Senate, and its committees, the <u>Faculty Council</u>, the <u>College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee</u>, and other ad-hoc committees, and regular conversations take place about areas for improvement. [<u>College Senate</u> 118, <u>Faculty Council 113</u>, and <u>LaGuardia Personnel and Budget Committee 98</u>] However, there is no system for assessing communication and for reporting their activities on a regular basis (i.e., each semester or yearly). The governance bodies should consider developing a more formalized procedure for assessing the effectiveness of their communication with their constituencies.